From:	Charles Mellon
To:	comments-southern-francismarion-sumter@fs.fed.us
Subject:	Chattooga River
Date:	08/07/2008 05:45 PM

U.S. Forest Service
Chattooga River Project
4931 Broad River Road
Columbia, SC 29212.

8.7.08

RE: Chattooga River Project Comments

Dear Sumter National Forest,

My name is Charles Mellon and although I live in Seattle WA I'm disheartened by what I have learned about the Chattooga and SC's management of natural resources. As river recreation grows towns and City's are realizing real benefits to tourism; however, the Southeast is usually left out of the topics of where to go next. Much of this is due to the unfriendly atmosphere gov't agencies and their lobbyists have fostered. As a kayaker I'm not fighting for my right to be there but rather for fair treatment for all users and welcome closure if it's in the best interest for a river. Closing a river to kaykers but open to fishing is a transparent abuse of gov't power for a special interest group and is shameful. I honestly don't believe this would ever be allowed out West so my interest in this isn't self serving.

I have reviewed the Environmental Assessment regarding the recreational management of the Chattooga River. I disagree with your analysis and your proposal. Both treat me and my community of river enthusiasts unfairly and your proposal would not meet my interests. Please consider the following concerns I have regarding this issue:

- The USFS has spent thirteen years searching for a reason to limit paddling on the Chattooga and has found *none*. It is time to open the river to boating.
- The EA is not a user capacity analysis and does not reference one. The AW appeal decision required a user capacity analysis. Where is it?
- No alternative is acceptable because they all include boating bans on the upper Chattooga Cliffs reach and on tributaries – without any justification.
- The EA and preferred alternative are not equitable or protective of the

river because they considers boating to be the only management variable, while other larger more impactful uses are not seriously considered for limits.

- The USFS preferred alternative includes a total ban on 2/3 of the upper river, a ban on tributary boating, and allows only 0-6 days of limited boating on the remaining reach – while allowing all other wilderness conforming existing uses in unlimited numbers.. This is not equitable and not acceptable!
- The EA offers no basis for the boating bans and limits
- The EA lacks a full range of alternatives
- The EA is no better or different than the last one, is at least a year late and has wasted millions in tax payer money
- The USFS hired qualified consultants and then ignored their input
- The 450 CFS average daily flow trigger in the preferred alternative is a flawed measure that should be eliminated from any considerations. There is no way a paddler can know this number and will be an administrative burden for the agency.
- Paddlers prefer an alternative similar to Alternative 8 that 1) fully allows boating on the entire Chattooga River below Grimshawes Bridge, 2) allows paddling on tributaries, 3) includes encounter standards based on a real user capacity analysis, 4) will *equitably* limit *total* use only when encounter standards are consistently exceeded, and 5) will do so using all available indirect measures first.
- The public should have the right to float on public Wild and Scenic Rivers regardless of who owns the land along the river.
- All aspects of the "Outstanding Remarkable Values" of Wild and Scenic Rivers should be protected on the entire river, not just in some areas.

Thank you for considering these comments. Please consider conducting a real user capacity analysis and immediately allowing boating in the same numbers, places, and seasons that you allow existing users. Paddling should be allowed in a similar manner to your alternative number 8, except on the *entire* Upper Chattooga River and its tributaries.

Thank you for considering these comments,

Sincerely

Charles **C** Mellon
Architect :: LEED AP
T 206 595 9690
F 206 783 0307

www.fusearc.com