

# **Chapter II**

## **Alternatives Including the Proposed Alternative**

## Table of Contents

<b>Chapter II Alternatives, Including the Proposed Action</b>	<b>II-1</b>
<b>A Introduction</b>	<b>II-1</b>
1. Summary of Changes from Draft to Final Environmental Impact Statement	II-2
2 Overview of this Chapter	II-3
<b>B Alternative Development</b>	<b>II-4</b>
1 Basis for Alternative Development	II-4
2 Analysis Process	II-5
a Introduction	II-5
b The FORPLAN Model	II-5
c Analysis Areas	II-6
d Changes from Draft to Final Environmental Impact Statement	II-6
e Prescriptions	II-6
f. Management Areas	II-7
g Using FORPLAN to Analyze Alternatives	II-7
h Additional Analysis Tools	II-11
3 The Analysis of the Management Situation (AMS) and Benchmark Analysis	II-12
a Supply and Demand	II-13
b Opportunity Costs	II-16
c Management Requirements	II-17
4 Alternative Formulation Process	II-19
a Development of Preliminary Alternatives	II-19
b Alternative Development Comments Received Prior to Release of Draft Environmental Impact Statement	II-20

5. Overview of All Alternatives . . . . .	II-27
a. Alternatives Considered but Eliminated from Detailed Study . . . . .	II-27
b. Alternatives Considered in Detail . . . . .	II-30
c. Mitigation Common to All Alternatives . . . . .	II-31
d. Management Direction Common to all Alternatives . . . . .	II-32
e. Required Alternatives . . . . .	II-32
6. Alternative Descriptions . . . . .	II-34
a. Alternative NC (No Change) . . . . .	II-34
b. Alternative A (No Action) . . . . .	II-36
c. Alternative B-Mod (DEIS Alternative B as Modified to Incorporate Preferred - Plus Alternative) . . . . .	II-39
d. Alternative C-Mod (DEIS Alternative C Modified to Incorporate Grant County Conservationist and Citizens Multiple Use Alternatives) . . . . .	II-42
e. Alternative F (Preferred Alternative in DEIS) . . . . .	II-45
f. Alternative I (Preferred Alternative) . . . . .	II-49
7. Management Areas by Alternative . . . . .	II-52
C. Comparison of Alternatives . . . . .	II-82
1. Resource Outputs, Environmental Effects, Activities, and Costs . . . . .	II-82
a. Comparison of Past, Present, and Future Timber Outputs . . . . .	II-94
b. Range - Alternative Comparisons . . . . .	II-104
c. Wildlife - Alternative Comparisons . . . . .	II-106
d. Fish - Alternative Comparisons . . . . .	II-109
e. Recreation - Alternative Comparisons . . . . .	II-111
f. Wildlife-Related Recreation - Alternative Comparisons . . . . .	II-113
g. Roadless Areas - Alternative Comparisons . . . . .	II-114
h. Wilderness - Alternative Comparisons . . . . .	II-114
i. Scenic Character - Alternative Comparisons . . . . .	II-115
j. Watershed - Alternative Comparisons . . . . .	II-116

k Minerals - Alternative Comparisons . . . . .	II-117
1 Transportation - Alternative Comparisons . . . . .	II-118
m Utility Corridors - Alternative Comparisons . . . . .	II-118
2 Economic Comparisons of Alternatives . . . . .	II-119
a Introduction . . . . .	II-119
b Important Differences in Economic Values Among Alternatives . . . . .	II-120
c Differences in Benefits, Costs, and Cash Flows . . . . .	II-124
3 Major Tradeoffs Among Alternatives . . . . .	II-125
a National, Regional, and Local Overview . . . . .	II-125
b. Responses to Major Issues, Concerns, and Opportunities . . . . .	II-127
c Differences and Similarities of Individual Alternatives . . . . .	II-131

**List of Tables**

II-1 Summary of Prescription Choices Available for Each Management Area	II-10
II-2 Summary of Projected Supply and Demand for Key Resource Elements	II-15
II-3 Summary of Management Requirements Constraint Analysis . . . . .	II-18
II-4 Management Areas by Alternatives	II-79
II-5 Quantifiable Resource Outputs and Environmental Effects by Alternatives . . . . .	II-83
II-6 Comparison - Past, Present, and Alternative Timber Outputs . . . . .	II-96
II-7 Timber Resource Management Information by Benchmark and Alternative . . . . .	II-99
II-8 Present Net Value and Discounted Benefits and Costs of Alternatives . . . . .	II-122
II-9 Present Net Value and Discounted Benefits and Costs by Resource Groups . . . . .	II-123
II-10 Average Annual Cash Flows and Noncash Benefits in the First and Fifth Decades by Alternative . . . . .	II-125
II-11 Comparison of Issue and Concern Resolution by Alternative . . . . .	II-128
II-12 Indicators of Response of Alternatives to Planning Issues and National Concerns	II-132

**List of Figures**

II-1 Benchmark Decision Space for Five Major Resource Indicators . . . . .	II-14
II-2 Management Areas for Alternative NC . . . . .	II-36
II-3 Management Areas for Alternative A . . . . .	II-39
II-4 Management Areas for Alternative B-Modified . . . . .	II-42
II-5 Management Areas for Alternative C-Modified . . . . .	II-45
II-6 Management Areas for Alternative F . . . . .	II-48
II-7 Management Areas for Alternative I . . . . .	II-52
II-8 Management Area 1 - General Forest . . . . .	II-53
II-9 Management Area 2 - Rangeland . . . . .	II-54
II-10 Management Area 3 (A and B) - Riparian Areas . . . . .	II-55
II-11 Management Area 4A - Big-Game Winter Range Maintenance . . . . .	II-56
II-12 Management Area 4B - Big-Game Winter Range Enhancement . . . . .	II-57
II-13 Management Area 5 - Bald Eagle Winter Roosts . . . . .	II-58
II-14 Management Area 6A - Strawberry Mountain Wilderness . . . . .	II-59
II-15 Management Area 6B - Monument Rock Wilderness . . . . .	II-60

II-16 Management Area 6C - Pine Creek . . . . .	II-61
II-17 Management Area 7 - Scenic Area . . . . .	II-62
II-18 Management Area 8 - Special Interest Areas	II-63
II-19 Management Area 9 - Research Natural Areas	II-64
II-20 Management Area 10 - Semi-Primitive, Non-Motorized Recreation Areas	II-65
II-21 Management Area 11 - Semi-Primitive, Motorized Recreation Areas	II-66
II-22 Management Area 12 - Developed Recreation . . . . .	II-67
II-23 Management Area 13 - Old Growth . . . . .	II-68
II-24 Management Area 14 - Visual Corridors . . . . .	II-69
II-25 Management Area 15 - Unit Plan Wildlife Emphasis Areas . . . . .	II-70
II-26 Management Area 16 - Minimum Level Management	II-71
II-27 Management Area 17 - Byram Gulch Municipal Supply Watershed . . . . .	II-72
II-28 Management Area 18 - Long Creek Municipal Supply Watershed . . . . .	II-73
II-29 Management Area 19 - Administrative Sites . . . . .	II-74
II-30 Management Area 20 - Wildlife Emphasis with Scheduled Timber Harvest	II-75
II-31 Management Area 21 - Wildlife Emphasis with Non-Scheduled Timber Harvest . . . . .	II-76
II-32 Management Area 22 - Wild and Scenic River	II-77
II-33 Percent of Forest by Management Area by Alternative . . . . .	II-81
II-34 Timber Stand Improvement Acres by Alternative . . . . .	II-103
II-35 Reforestation Planting by Alternative . . . . .	II-103
II-36 Grazing Capacity by Alternative . . . . .	II-105
II-37 Potential Rocky Mountain Elk Populations	II-106
II-38 Big-Game Use (Wildlife User-Days) by Alternative . . . . .	II-106
II-39 Potential Pairs of Indicator Species for Old Growth by Alternative	II-107
II-40 Total Acres of Old Growth by Alternative . . . . .	II-107
II-41 Acres of Old Growth Remaining Over Time by Alternative	II-108
II-42 Potential Populations of Cavity-Nesting Species by Alternative . . . . .	II-109
II-43 Anadromous Fish Habitat Improvement by Alternative	II-110
II-44 Potential Chinook Salmon Production by Alternative . . . . .	II-110
II-45 Potential Steelhead Production by Alternative	II-111
II-46 First Decade Roaded Recreation Opportunity by Alternative . . . . .	II-112
II-47 First Decade Semi-Primitive Recreation Opportunity . . . . .	II-112
II-48 Average Annual Wildlife-and-Fish-User-Day Capacity . . . . .	II-113
II-49 Non-Wilderness Acres Retained Under a Nondevelopment Management Strategy by Alternative . . . . .	II-114
II-50 Wilderness Use Capacity by Alternative . . . . .	II-115
II-51 Visual Management Acres by Alternative . . . . .	II-116
II-52 Acres of Watershed Improvement by Alternative	II-116
II-53 Index of Relative Sediment Effects of Alternatives	II-117
II-54 Miles of Timber Purchaser Road Construction by Alternative	II-118