

Chapter 2 – Alternatives, Including the Proposed Action

This chapter describes alternative development, alternatives considered in detail, resource protection measures, and a comparison of alternatives.

Alternative Development

The Proposed Action was developed to meet the purpose and need for action at Orr Lake. Early in the planning process seven other designs were considered, but we determined that they did not meet all aspects of the purpose and need for action. Several other campground and facilities designs were considered and eliminated because they did not accommodate the purpose and need as well as the selected design. The eliminated designs can be found in the Orr Lake Recreation Development project file.

Alternatives Considered in Detail

Two alternatives were considered in detail for the proposed project.

Alternative A - No Action

Alternative A is the "No Action" alternative, in which no project activities would be proposed.

Alternative B – The Proposed Action

The Goosenest Ranger District of the KNF proposes to develop an existing campground adjacent to Orr Lake, with development on the east side and north end as described in Chapter 1.

Resource Protection Measures Included in the Proposed Action

Air Quality

A standard dust abatement clause will be included in the construction contract.

Noxious Weeds

To prevent the introduction of any noxious weeds into the project area the standard C-clause, 6.36, Equipment Cleaning will be required (now standard practice on the KNF). This provision states that all equipment that may harbor noxious weed seeds or plant parts, and will be used off-road for the project, will be pre-cleaned of all dirt and debris.

Any fills, mulches, or revegetation seeding, used during or after project implementation will be certified weed free.

Wildlife

New road construction will be restricted January 1 – July 31 to avoid direct disturbance to breeding bald eagles.

Watershed Health and Fisheries

Best Management Practices (BMPs): BMPs are water quality maintenance and improvement measures developed in compliance with the Clean Water Act, certified by the State Water Resources Control Board and approved by the Environmental Protection Agency. The BMPs appropriate for the proposed action are listed in Appendix B.

Wet Weather Operation Standards (WWOs): WWOs would be applied to protect the transportation system, maintain water quality, and preserve the soil resource. The Wet Weather Operations Standards and Field Guide, revised May 16, 2002, is incorporated by reference and on file in the project record. The WWOs were developed by the Forest, in conjunction with the USFS Pacific Southwest Region and a representative from the North Coast Water Quality Control Board. The standards are intended to provide more specific information to assist field employees in determining when activities are at risk of not meeting BMPs. The goal of the WWOs is to avoid “excessive damage,” which should not occur if the standards are being met. The guidelines would be used to determine if conditions are favorable for wet weather or winter operations, and to provide guidance as to when conditions warrant suspension of operations, when operations may begin or resume, or when and what remedies may be appropriate. Use of native and aggregate surface roads during runoff producing precipitation shall be restricted to reduce sediment production to Orr Lake.

Cultural

Placement of barrier cloth and fill material on the archaeological site at the north end of Orr Lake will follow the conditions listed in Attachment B, II of “First Amended Regional Programmatic Agreement Among the USDA Forest Service, Pacific Southwest Region, California State Historic Preservation Officer, and Advisory Council on Historic Preservation Regarding the Process for Compliance With Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act for Undertakings On the National Forests of The Pacific Southwest Region.” The project may

proceed without affecting the site, as long as all construction in the north area is retained within or on the fill material.

Comparison of Alternatives

Table 1 provides comparative summaries of effects associated with the alternatives analyzed in detail.

Table 1. Comparison of Alternatives for the Orr Lake Campground Project.

Comparison factor	Alternative A No Action	Alternative B Proposed Action
Cultural Resources around Orr Lake	The Native American site on the north end of Orr Lake will continue to be eroded by continued human use. Illegal artifact collection and excavation in this area will continue to degrade the site.	Placement of barrier cloth and fill material will protect the north site from soil erosion. The relationship of subsurface site elements and artifacts will be preserved.
Human health & safety at Orr Lake	Unsanitary conditions on the north end will continue to threaten soil and water quality in Orr Lake.	Placement of two vaulted toilets on the north side, one vaulted toilet on the east side, and drinking water at both ends (if possible) will provide a safer human environment at Orr Lake.
Recreation experience at Orr Lake	Lack of toilets continues to inconvenience users. The quality of the site continues to decline as a result of uncontrolled use. There is no disruption of any recreation uses in the area.	Placement of two toilets on the north end (northwest and northeast sides) would provide greater user comfort and convenience. Hardening the site with facility development would improve the quality of the site. Some uses (i.e. camping) may either be temporarily disrupted (closed) or impacted (noise, dust) during construction.
Riparian habitat around Orr Lake	Vehicle and heavy foot traffic around the lake and on the connecting road will continue to negatively impact riparian vegetation.	Riparian vegetation around the lake is expected to reestablish because of the placement and use of proposed fishing platforms and the new connecting road.
Soil erosion around Orr Lake	Vehicle traffic on the existing connecting road will continue to contribute to soil erosion into the lake which negatively impacts fish, and amphibian habitat.	Converting the existing connecting road to a hiking/biking trail and constructing a new road further upslope will reduce soil erosion. The reduction in sediment into Orr Lake will have a beneficial effect on fish and amphibian habitat.