

PROPOSED DRY LAKES LAND EXCHANGE

**Apache-Sitgreaves National Forests
Alpine, Lakeside and Springerville Ranger Districts**

Chapter 1

Background

The purpose and need for action, the proposed Federal action, the decision to be made, issues raised during scoping, and a description of the project area are included in this comment document. The “purpose and need” explains why the action is being proposed. The “proposed action” details who is proposing what, and when and where the proposal would occur. The “decision framework” describes the nature of the decision and who will make it, allowing for selection of the “no-action” alternative required by 36 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) 1502.14 (d). The “issues” section describes concerns or problems that might be created by implementing the proposal. The “measures” discussion outlines the units of measure selected to evaluate the extent to which the proposed action and alternatives attain project objectives and resolution of issues.

Purpose and Need for Action

Existing Condition

BC2 LLC/Genesis Real Estate and Development, Inc. (BC2 LLC) owns numerous parcels of non-Federal (private) lands located within the Alpine, Lakeside and Springerville Ranger Districts, Apache-Sitgreaves National Forests (A-S). BC2 LLC has offered to exchange five separate parcels that are currently undeveloped, and for the most part, parcels that would contribute to the blocking up of public land ownership and improved management. BC2 LLC acquired the five tracts specifically to offer them in exchange for the selected Federal lands in the Morgan Flat area. Private land within the Porter Mountain and Misty Mountain subdivisions that is currently owned by others shares common boundaries with the selected Federal parcels and the proponent’s non-Federal Morgan Wash parcel. Much of adjoining private property has already been developed into residential lots containing single family homes. The proponent’s lands are currently available for development. Any development of these parcels could diminish their value as undeveloped natural forestland and lead to the establishment of activities that would be incompatible with the surrounding National Forest character. The non-Federal lands also currently contribute to an undesirable ownership pattern. All, except for the Morgan Wash parcel are located in Management Area (MA) 2, classified as Woodland, in the Apache-Sitgreaves National Forests Land Management Plan (LMP). The Morgan Wash parcel is located in MA 1, classified as Forested Land. All of the offered non-Federal parcels meet one or more of the criteria in the A-S LMP necessary for classifying them as desirable for acquisition. These scattered parcels of private land (inholdings) increase Federal land management complexity because the miles of common, or shared, landline boundaries with Federal lands add to administrative costs and the potential for encroachments to occur on the National Forest.

The five separate parcels of Federal land selected by the proponent for exchange are all located in Management Area 1, Forested Land, of the A-S LMP. The management direction for this area states lands offered by the United States are needed to meet the needs of expanding communities, would provide for consolidation of public lands, improve management or benefit specific resources, and meet overriding public needs.

Desired Condition

The desired condition of the lands is that the non-Federal lands are accepted and included into the National Forest System (NFS). Four fewer private inholdings would exist in the A-S.

Multiple benefits to the NFS would be expected with the addition of the offered non-Federal lands. They include a reduction in complex ownership patterns that would help to block up public land ownership; one small totally isolated tract of Federal land has been disposed of; the elimination of numerous miles of landline boundaries and controlling corners that contribute to management efficiency; elimination of any possible future subdivision/residential development on these remote private inholdings within the Forests' boundaries; and the acquisition of one parcel containing a portion of Morgan Wash containing riparian habitat for wildlife species. This land exchange contributes towards Goal 3, Objective 1 of the Forest Service Strategic Plan for FY 2004-2008 by improving access to NFS lands and Goal 6, Objective 3 by increasing the acres of land acquired through adjustments that conserve the integrity of undeveloped lands and habitat quality (Strategic Plan of the USDA Forest Service for Fiscal Years 2004-2008).

Objectives

The Forest Service has the responsibility to manage NFS lands for appropriate public uses. This includes making adjustments in land ownership clearly in the public interest and consistent with land management planning objectives.

The purpose of the proposed action is to meet the following objectives:

1. Acquisition of non-federal lands within the existing Forest boundaries that contribute to the blocking up of public land ownership, reduce the likelihood of trespass on, or damage to NFS lands, and facilitate fire and resource management.
2. Acquisition of non-Federal water influenced lands within existing Forest boundaries that contain habitat for wildlife and plant species.
3. Make available the selected Federal lands for future residential development in the Pinetop-Lakeside area to meet the needs of expanding communities. This includes one totally isolated parcel that cannot be efficiently managed for National Forest purposes.

For an exchange to take place, both parties to the exchange must agree on the total package.

The non-Federal landowner BC2 LLC agrees the exchange satisfies their needs and requirements for their planned residential development in the Morgan Flat area.

The proposed exchange would be consistent with the management direction, goals and objectives of the A-S LMP and would serve the public interest (36 CFR 254.3(b)(2)). The A-S LMP Standards and Guidelines consider the non-Federal lands as desirable for acquisition and the Federal lands as available for conveyance under land exchange authorities.

If acquired by the United States, the non-Federal lands would be incorporated into the Management Areas in which they are located (36 CFR 254.3(f)). Management direction for any acquired land would be the same as surrounding Federal lands, unless otherwise changed by future amendment of the A-S LMP.

Proposed Action

The A-S is proposing to exchange lands with BC2 LLC under authority of the General Exchange Act of March 20, 1922; the Federal Land Policy and Management Act of October 21, 1976 (FLPMA); and the Federal Land Exchange Facilitation Act of August 20, 1988 (FLEFA). The proposed land-for-land exchange would result in Federal acquisition of 586.4 acres of land in the A-S and conveyance of 176.9 acres of land in the Morgan Flat area (adjoining Porter Mountain Estates and Misty Mountain Estates) in the A-S.

The non-Federal lands would provide additional Federally managed habitat for wildlife and plant species. There would be blocking up of public land ownership resulting in a reduction in complex ownership patterns. The elimination of numerous miles of landline boundaries and controlling corners would contribute to management efficiency. Any future subdivision/residential development on the parcels that are currently private inholdings within the Forests' boundaries would be eliminated. On a Forest-wide basis an additional 410 acres of land would be available for public recreation use.

The conveyance of Federal lands to BC2 LLC would increase the number of acres of real estate holdings they control within the Morgan Flat area. Additional private land would be available for new residential development and increased rural fire protection in the Pinetop-Lakeside area. BC2 LLC has committed to donating land to the Lakeside Fire District for construction of a new fire station located adjacent to Porter Mountain Estates. The Forest Service would issue Navajo County two public road easements, one for access to a new fire station and up to four adjacent residential lots and a second to ensure there is continued access to National Forest lands south of Federal Tract E.

A preliminary analysis of the proposal was completed and included in a Feasibility Analysis that was approved by the Director of Lands & Minerals USDA Forest Service, Southwestern Region on March 31, 2003. An Agreement To Initiate an evaluation of a land exchange was authorized by the Director of Lands & Minerals USDA Forest Service, Southwestern Region on March 31, 2003. A real property appraisal of the final proposal was completed to establish market values prior to an exchange. The appraisal had a Valuation Date of August 13, 2004 that expired on January 14, 2005. A new appraisal would need to be completed and Agency-approved land values determined prior to the execution of an Exchange Agreement.

The following are descriptions of both the Federal and non-Federal land parcels included in this proposal.

Federal Lands to be Exchanged total 176.9 acres

Tract A (78.93 acres): This parcel is currently public land within the Sitgreaves National Forest and Lakeside Ranger District. The land has an elevation of 7,045 to 7,120 feet above sea level (a.s.l.). Vegetation consists of a scattered overstory of second growth ponderosa pine with an understory of various grasses, scattered oak brush and small openings. A Navopache Electric power transmission line crosses the parcel in a northeast-southwest direction. Forest Road (FR) 9717 creates the eastern boundary and FR 45 the northern boundary. Private land adjoins it along both the west and south sides.

Tract B (5.11 acres): This parcel is currently public land within the Sitgreaves National Forest and Lakeside Ranger District. The land has an elevation of 7,000 feet a.s.l. Vegetation consists of second growth ponderosa pine overstory and scattered oak brush. The tract legally described as Lot 16 is the only portion of the originally identified Tract B that remains in the exchange. (The majority of selected lands in the originally identified tract were dropped from the exchange at the request of the non-Federal party due to the presence of several unpatented mining claims. The Forest Service concurred with consideration to public comments.) Private land adjoins it along the east and south sides. No roads currently access this parcel. Navajo County has agreed to accept a public road easement from the Forest Service for access to this parcel from FR 45.

Tract C (42.10 acres): This parcel is currently public land within the Sitgreaves National Forest and Lakeside Ranger District. The land has an elevation of 7,000 to 7,020 feet a.s.l. Vegetation consists of a scattered overstory of second growth ponderosa pine with an understory of various grasses, scattered oak brush and small openings. FR 45F crosses through the parcel north-south near the center of the property. A Navopache Electric power transmission line crosses the parcel in a northeast-southwest-west direction. Private land adjoins it along the north, east and south sides.

Tract D (30.96 acres): This parcel is currently public land within the Sitgreaves National Forest and Lakeside Ranger District. The land has an elevation of 7,060 feet a.s.l. Vegetation consists of a scattered

overstory of second growth ponderosa pine with an understory of various grasses, scattered oak brush and small openings. This Federal parcel is completely surrounded by private land. No road currently provides access to the parcel. An exchange of easements has been agreed to by both the non-Federal party and the Forest Service that assures legal access to this parcel across the adjoining private land between Federal Tracts E and D that is owned by the non-Federal party.

Tract E (19.80 acres): This parcel is currently public land within the Sitgreaves National Forest and Lakeside Ranger District. The land has an elevation of 7,020 to 7,040 feet a.s.l. Vegetation consists of a scattered overstory of second growth ponderosa pine with an understory of various grasses, scattered oak brush and small openings. A small seep affecting an area less than 0.1 acre in size with minimal wetland type species present is located on the parcel. Private land adjoins it along the north and east sides. The non-Federal party has agreed to the Forest Service reserving a north-south road easement through the parcel that would provide for continued public access to National Forest land south of the parcel. An easement for this section of road would be granted to Navajo County extending the length of the current County Road easement for FR 45F through the parcel. The Forest Service would grant an easement to the non-Federal party for a west-east road paralleling the northeast boundary of the tract and entering private land owned by the non-Federal party that lies between Federal Tracts E and D. In return the non-Federal party would grant an easement across the northern boundary of their land (continuation of same road) for access from Federal Tract E to Tract D.

The Federal lands do not contain any inventoried roadless areas or Wild and Scenic River corridors or study areas.

Following are the legal descriptions of the Federal lands:

Sitgreaves National Forest

Lakeside Ranger District

GILA AND SALT RIVER MERIDIAN, Navajo County, Arizona
T. 9 N., R. 23 E.

sec. 3 — lots 10, 15, 17, 19, and 20. (Tract A)

Containing 78.93 acres, more or less.

sec. 4 — lot 16. (Tract B)

Containing 5.11 acres, more or less.

sec. 9 — lots 1, 2 and 3; N1/2N1/2S1/2SW1/4. (Tracts C, D, E)

Containing 92.86 record acres, more or less.

Maps displaying the Federal lands are at the end of this document.

Private Lands to be Acquired total 586.4 acres

South Fork Parcel (111.09 acres): This parcel is within the Apache National Forest on the Springerville Ranger District. The parcel is located about eight miles west of the town of Eagar and south of State Highway 260, approximately one-quarter mile northwest of the Little Colorado River. A road right-of-way easement granted by the Arizona State Land Department to BC2 LLC provides legal access to the property from State Highway 260. Physical access is provided by a low standard road from SH 260 through a locked ADOT gate that is not located within the described easement. The land has an elevation

of 7,700 to 8,040 feet a.s.l. Vegetation is primarily plains grassland. The parcel adjoins private land on its east and northwest sides, state land along the northeast, and National Forest on the south and west.

Dry Lakes Parcel (260.00 acres): This parcel is within the Apache National Forest on the Springerville Ranger District. The parcel is the largest in the proposed land exchange and is located within the Dry Lakes drainage about eight miles north of Escudilla Mountain. The land has an elevation of 7,580 to 7,680 feet a.s.l. Vegetation is plains grassland and pinyon-juniper woodland. The parcel includes approximately 0.5 miles of an unnamed tributary to the enclosed basin of Dry Lakes. This basin is characterized by soft sandy soils with two depressions that are seasonally inundated during wet periods. Drainage of the parcel is to the north. Access is by low standard Forest Service Roads. The property is currently surrounded by Federal lands except for a 20 acre parcel of private land owned by others along the northeast corner. The owner of this parcel was contacted by the BC2 LLC regarding the availability of the 20 acres for purchase and inclusion in the exchange. The response was that the land was not for sale.

Reagan Reservoir Parcel (160.00 acres): This parcel is within the Apache National Forest on the Springerville Ranger District. The parcel is just north of Reagan Reservoir and approximately seven miles north of Escudilla Mountain. The land has an elevation of 7,720 to 7,860 feet a.s.l. Vegetation is plains grassland and pinyon-juniper woodland. Drainage of the parcel is to the north. The parcel is surrounded on all sides by Federal lands. Access is by low standard Forest Service Roads.

Nutrioso Parcel (20.34 acres): This parcel is within the Apache National Forest on the Alpine Ranger District. The parcel is located about two miles northwest of the community of Nutrioso and three miles northwest of Escudilla Mountain. The parcel is bordered by National Forest on the north, east, south, and southwest sides. Private land adjoins it on the northwest side. The land has an elevation of 7,700 to 7,800 feet a.s.l. Vegetation is primarily plains grassland fringed by pinyon-juniper woodland and ponderosa pine forest. An old falling down cabin located on the parcel was removed in 2004 by the non-Federal party. The parcel includes approximately 0.10 mile of a small, unnamed tributary to Nutrioso Creek. Access is by a low standard road that crosses the adjacent private property along the west boundary. There is no legal access to the parcel.

Morgan Wash Parcel (35.00 acres): This parcel is within the Sitgreaves National Forest on the Lakeside Ranger District. The parcel is located in the southwest corner of the Morgan Flat area and adjoins private land along its north, east and southeast sides. National Forest adjoins it on the south and west sides. The land has an elevation of 7,100 feet a.s.l. Vegetation consists of a scattered overstory of second growth ponderosa pine with an understory of various grasses, scattered oak brush and small openings. The parcel includes approximately 0.5 miles of Morgan Wash, a tributary to Scott Reservoir. Access is from the northeast by low standard roads from the end of the Sponseller Siding County Road (FR 9717). An exchange of easements has been agreed to by both the non-Federal party and the Forest Service that would provide public road access across the northeast boundary of Federal Tract E through the non-Federal party's land, to Tract D. This exchange of easements will most likely occur even if the land exchange is not carried forward because of the mutual benefits to both parties. The public benefit is legal access to Tract D, which increases its land value. The benefit to the non-Federal party is more direct legal access to their lands south of Tract D, whether the land exchange is completed or not. If the land exchange is completed, public access to the Morgan Wash parcel would be either across Forest System lands to the west or across the non-Federal party's public subdivision roads.

Apache National Forest
Springerville Ranger District

GILA AND SALT RIVER MERIDIAN, Apache County, Arizona

T. 8 N., R. 27 E.

sec. 24 — lot 1;

(South Fork)

T. 8 N., R. 28 E.

sec. 19 — lots 6 and 7.

Containing 111.09 record acres, more or less.

T. 8 N., R. 30 E.

sec. 26 — NE1/4,E1/2NE1/4NW1/4,N1/2SE1/4.

(Dry Lakes)

Containing 260.00 record acres, more or less.

T. 8 N., R. 30 E.

sec. 35 — W1/2SW1/4NE1/4, SE1/4SW1/4NE1/4,
SW1/4SE1/4NE1/4,E1/2SE1/4NW1/4,
W1/4NE1/4, SE1/4,E1/2NW1/4SE1/4,
E1/2SW1/4SE1/4,SE1/4SE1/4.

(Reagan Reservoir)

Containing 160.00 record acres, more or less.

Alpine Ranger District

T. 7 N., R. 30 E.

sec. 21 — SE1/4SW1/4SE1/4;
sec. 28 — lot 12.

(Nutrioso)

Containing 20.34 record acres, more or less.

Sitgreaves National Forest

Lakeside Ranger District

T. 9 N., R. 23 E.

sec. 9 — S1/2NW1/4SW1/4SE1/4,
S1/2SW1/4SE1/4, SW1/4SE4/1SE1/4.

(Morgan Wash)

Containing 35.00 record acres, more or less.

Maps displaying the non-Federal lands are at the end of this document.

Connected Actions

The Forest Service and BC2 LLC would exchange road easements to provide access to Federal Tract D and other private lands not identified for exchange. The Forest Service would issue two public road easements to Navajo County, one for access through Federal Tract E to adjoining National Forest lands and a second for access to Federal Tract B where a new Lakeside Fire District Fire Station would be built. Navajo County would relocate sections of FR 45 along the northern boundary of Federal Tract A in order to improve sight distance and reduce horizontal and vertical curves (Figure 8 in the maps section at end of this document displays the easement locations).

Decision Framework

The Forest Supervisor, Apache-Sitgreaves National Forests, will decide if the land exchange should take place as described in the proposed action, including the connected actions, or as modified or not at all.

Public Involvement

The A-S requested public input for this proposed project to determine the issues of concern. A Land Exchange Notice was published once per week for four consecutive weeks on December 10, 17, 24, and 31, 2002 in the *White Mountain Independent* for Navajo and Apache Counties. The County, State, and Congressional delegations were also notified. An amendment to the originally published original Land Exchange Notice was published once per week for four consecutive weeks on June 24, July 1, 8, and 15, 2003 in the *White Mountain Independent* for Navajo and Apache Counties. The amendment provided notification that the non-Federal South Fork Parcel was being added to the exchange configuration. The County, State, and Congressional delegations were also notified of this amendment.

A mailing list of 237 addresses was compiled that included potentially interested Federal, State, and local agencies, as well as individuals and organizations that it was believed would have an interest in or be affected by the project. A scoping report dated June 24, 2003 was mailed to the list of potentially interested publics. The scoping report included a description of the proposed project, maps showing the lands being considered for exchange, and requested comments by telephone or in writing. Comments were requested by July 29, 2003.

The A-S received 35 comments directly as letters and some additionally as e-mails. Comments received after the due date identified in the scoping report (July 29, 2003), were also included and analyzed by the Interdisciplinary Team (IDTeam) for the project.

Issues

Issues are disputes, debates or discussions about environmental effects that may be created by the proposed project. This section presents any significant issues identified during the scoping process and internal agency review. The ID Team grouped and analyzed comments received from scoping. Potential issues were collected and screened to ascertain which were significant to the proposed action and would be used to develop alternatives, focus the analysis, or identify mitigation measures, if necessary. Many comments concern areas of analysis which we are required by law, regulation, or policy to include in the document, therefore, they are not listed as issues, but are included in the analysis. Copies of all comments are contained in the project file.

Issue: Effect of Future Development of Federal Lands

During scoping many commentors were concerned with future development on the Federal lands. The proponent has stated that he intends to subdivide the Federal parcels into one-acre or larger residential lots in full compliance with Navajo County subdivision requirements. The possible general effects of development will be analyzed in the cumulative effects section of each affected resource, including property values and taxes, scenic values and recreation access, and effects on infrastructure, community services, noise, traffic, and pollution.¹

¹ Lands conveyed out of Federal ownership become subject to all laws, regulations and zoning authorities of State and local governing bodies (Forest Service Manual 5400). Various State of Arizona agencies as well as Navajo County would be the regulatory authorities for all land use and development-related activities, which may occur on the contiguous block of private land (the selected Federal and the private land adjacent to the selected Federal land), or other private land within Navajo County. The Forest Service has long taken the position that zoning and regulation of uses on private land are within the responsibility of state and local governments. Local authorities are in the best position to determine appropriate uses of private land. Except as authorized by law, order, or regulation, Forest Service policies, practices, and procedures shall avoid regulating private property use (Forest Service Manual 5403.3). Local governments have traditionally agreed and insisted that such decisions be left to them.

Chapter 2

Alternative development process

The range of alternatives for a land exchange is limited by the exchange process itself. A balanced exchange package is arrived at by a series of proposals and counter proposals between the Federal and non-Federal parties until both parties accept a mix of parcels. Once both parties agree upon an acceptable mix of lands, the Federal agency proposes to go forward with an analysis of the action. The exchange proposal analyzed reflects lands mutually agreed upon by the non-Federal landowner and the Forest Service. Land exchanges convey land, interests in land, and the resources associated with them. The environmental analysis focuses on the future use and management of the lands acquired and conveyed and the effect of the exchange on the lands that adjoin them.

Description of Alternatives, including those not carried forward

In initial discussions additional Federal lands, including a larger Federal Tract B lying south of the centerline of FR 45 and north of the existing private land in Section 4, T. 9 N., R. 23 E. were identified by the land exchange proponent as being desirable for exchange. As discussions proceeded, the proponent withdrew his request for approximately 90 acres of additional Federal lands in order to balance values based on preliminary estimates of value for the lands. The Forest Service concurred with consideration to public comments. The non-Federal South Fork parcel was eventually added to the proposal in order to balance the values in the exchange. Finally, all but 5.11 acres of Tract B were dropped from the proposal at the request of the non-Federal party due to the presence of several unpatented mining claims on the tract that they could not get relinquished.

Other means of acquiring the non-Federal lands were considered but eliminated from further study. The sale of non-Federal lands to the United States is an alternative to a land exchange for acquisition of non-Federal properties. However, Land and Water Conservation Act funds to purchase the privately owned parcels are presently not available. It is anticipated that appropriated funds for Federal land purchases will continue to be limited in the foreseeable future. Even if funds were available the land exchange proponent is not interested in selling his land to the United States and has made the land available on the basis of exchange only.

Alternatives Considered in Detail

1. **No Action.** No exchange of land would occur between the Forest Service and BC2 LLC. Lands would remain in their current ownership.
2. **Proposed Action.** Exchange approximately 586.4 acres of non-Federal land for 176.9 acres of Federal land. Refer to maps and legal descriptions of the non-Federal lands and Federal lands.

This chapter compares the two alternatives considered for the Dry Lakes Land Exchange. It includes a tabular comparison and maps of the lands being considered for exchange. This section displays the alternatives in comparative form defining the differences between the alternatives and providing a clear basis for choice among options by the decision maker and the public. Some of the information used to compare the alternatives is based upon the design of the alternative (i.e., acres of land currently in Federal ownership versus acres of land in Federal ownership after exchange) and some of the information may be based upon the environmental, social and economic effects of implementing each alternative (i.e., total acres of Federal land currently containing wetlands and floodplains versus total acres of Federal land containing wetlands and floodplains after exchange).

Comparison of Alternatives

This section provides a summary of the effects of implementing the alternatives. Information in the table is focused on activities and effects where different levels of effects or outputs can be distinguished quantitatively or qualitatively among alternatives.

Table 1. Alternative Comparison Table

AFFECTED RESOURCE/ISSUE	ALTERNATIVE 1 No Action	ALTERNATIVE 2 Proposed Action
Water quality Federal Non-Federal	No change in water quality would be expected. No change in water quality assuming no development. No unacceptable change in water quality is expected for Morgan Wash which is likely to be developed.	No unacceptable change in water quality is expected. State and County regulations control discharges. Stormwater managed. No change in water quality would be expected.
Scenic quality Federal Non-Federal	No change in scenic quality would be expected. No change in scenic quality assuming no development. Change in scenic quality for Morgan Wash would be limited as its location is remote and not easily accessed.	Scenic quality is expected to be moderately altered as a result of residential development. Any change would likely be restricted to the immediate vicinity of the private lands adjacent to the Federal parcels to be exchanged. No change in scenic quality would be expected.
Plants and wildlife Federal Non-Federal	Continued management and protection of 176.12 acres of habitat for management indicator species and retention of natural buffer areas for management indicator and priority migratory bird species in Woolhouse Habitat Area. No change expected assuming no development occurs. Possible for some reduction, elimination, and/or fragmentation of 55.34 acres of habitat for management indicator species and some priority migratory bird species through potential development of two non-Federal parcels in the short-term.	Anticipate some reduction, elimination, and/or fragmentation of 176.12 acres of habitat for management indicator species and loss of natural buffer areas for management indicator and priority migratory bird species that use Woolhouse Habitat Area. No change expected. Long-term protection and management extended to 586.4 acres of habitat for management indicator and priority migratory birds species through acquisition of non-Federal parcels and incorporation into A-S.
Soil and Air Federal Non-Federal	No measurable soil loss would be expected. No change assuming no development occurs. No measurable soil loss expected if	No measurable soil loss expected as development would occur under state and county regulations. County requires subdivision roads be paved. No measurable soil loss would be expected.

AFFECTED RESOURCE/ISSUE	ALTERNATIVE 1 No Action	ALTERNATIVE 2 Proposed Action
	development occurs on Morgan Wash. Development would occur under state and county regulations. County requires subdivision roads be paved.	
Land Use Federal Non-Federal	No change would be expected. 586.4 acres of private non-Federal lands would remain available for development.	176.9 acres of Federal lands would be converted to private ownership and become available for residential development. 586.4 acres of private non-Federal lands would be converted to Federal lands and no longer be available for development.
Heritage resources Federal Non-Federal	The Federal lands have been surveyed and no sites were found that qualify for the SHPO registry. No sites are known to exist. Human burials protected. No protection of cultural resources. Human burials protected.	Same as No Action. Any resources, if found, would be afforded complete Federal protection.
Grazing resources Federal lands Non-Federal Lands	Permitted numbers of livestock would remain the same. Private grazing leases would likely remain in effect subject to the discretion of the property owner.	The Blue Ridge Allotment would be reduced in size by 79 acres. The Sponsellor Allotment would be reduced in size by 66 acres. Permitted numbers of livestock would not change as a result of an exchange. Acquired Non-Federal lands would be integrated into the A-S LMP Management Areas in which they are located and managed in accordance with the laws, rules, regulations and LMP standards and guidelines applicable to those areas.
Mineral resources Federal Non-Federal	Mineral estates would remain the same. Mineral estates would remain the same.	Respective mineral estates would be conveyed. Respective mineral estates would be conveyed.
Hazardous materials Federal Non-Federal	No hazardous material is known to exist. No hazardous material is known to exist.	Same as No Action. Same as No Action.
Wetlands and floodplains Federal Non-Federal	No increase in Federally managed mappable floodplain. The wetland/riparian habitats would remain under the same ownership. No change to floodplain unless development were to occur.	No mappable riparian / wetland / floodplains occur on the Federal lands to be exchanged. The proposal will result in no effect to these habitats on the Federal parcels. The FS would gain 0.9 miles/5 acres of mappable channel/floodplain associated with the Morgan Wash, Dry Lakes and Nutrioso non-Federal parcels.

AFFECTED RESOURCE/ISSUE	ALTERNATIVE 1 No Action	ALTERNATIVE 2 Proposed Action
Caves	No natural caves are found on either the Federal or non-Federal lands.	No natural caves are found on either the Federal or non-Federal lands, therefore none would be lost. The proposal will result in no effect to caves. No other special management areas designated in the ASF LMP occur on the Federal or non-Federal lands.
Social & economic factors Federal Non-Federal	PILT receipts received by Navajo and Apache Counties would not change. Overall, property taxes collected by the Counties would not change assuming no development, except for an increase if Morgan Wash were to be developed.	Property taxes collected by Navajo County would increase as residential development occurred on Federal lands. PILT receipts no longer received by Navajo County. Property taxes no longer collected in Apache County. PLIT receipts received by Apache County would increase. Property taxes no longer collected by Navajo County for Morgan Wash.
Administrative factors Federal	No change in existing corners or landline administration.	25 landline property corners and 8.625 miles of boundary maintenance would be eliminated.
Values of adjacent properties Federal Non-Federal	Land values would not change. No change in values would be expected.	Overall, not expected to change land values; adjoining property may not appreciate as quickly. Change in values would not be expected. Majority of adjacent property is FS.
Public services Federal Non-Federal	No changes would be expected. No changes would be expected assuming no development, except for Morgan Wash.	Demand for utilities and road improvements would be expected to increase. New water source and storage developed. Individual on-site wastewater disposal. Land for building a new fire station would be made available. No changes would be expected.
Outdoor recreation & access Federal Non-Federal	No change in access or lands available for outdoor recreation would be expected. No change in access or lands available for outdoor recreation would be expected.	Direct access to National Forest lands from private property owners currently bordering several tracts would no longer exist. There would be a local loss of 142 acres in the Morgan Flat area available for outdoor recreation. Forest-wide there would be a gain of 410 acres available for outdoor recreation.
Infrastructure, traffic, dust, and pollution Federal Non-Federal	No changes would be expected. No changes would be expected assuming no development, except for Morgan Wash which which is likely to be developed.	New infrastructure would comply with County and State subdivision requirements. All streets would be paved. Stormwater managed. No changes would be expected.